



CITY OF DURHAM | NORTH CAROLINA

Date: June 12, 2012

To: Thomas J. Bonfield, City Manager

Through: Theodore L. Voorhees, Deputy City Manager *TLV*
Donald F. Greeley, Director, Water Management *MLG*

From: Jerry F. Morrone, Engineering Supervisor, Water Management *JFM*

Subject: Evaluation of Additional References for TruGreen LandCare LLC
Contract SR-54: Utility Easement Maintenance, Mowing and Hand Cutting

Executive Summary

As a follow-up to potential award of Contract SR-54 to the second-low bidder, the City Manager requested that a senior-level staff member from Department of Water Management (DWM) re-evaluate the award recommendation and include a review of the apparent-low bidder's new list of past work experiences. DWM Engineering Supervisor, Jerry F. Morrone, P.E., reviewed the original and additional work experiences provided by the apparent-low bidder, TruGreen LandCare, LLC (TruGreen), and discussed recent past work with TruGreen clients.

Based on information provided by three (3) of five (5) new references for TruGreen, DWM feels TruGreen does not have similar-type work experience and that TruGreen would not be able to successfully complete the contract. DWM recommends award to Bushhog America, Inc.

Background

On March 13, 2012, DWM received bids for mowing, maintenance and hand cutting services for 200 miles of water and sewer easements. Approximately 100 miles of these easements are considered difficult to reach as they extend across meandering streams, into wetlands, or are submerged for long time periods. Access may be over rough terrain or through private property, requiring proper notification and restoration of disturbed areas. The contract requires clearing of these easements be completed in a 4-month mowing season.

After bids were reviewed by DWM staff from the Water & Sewer Maintenance and Utility Engineering Divisions, DWM recommended award of this contract to Bushhog America, Inc. (Bushhog), the second-low bidder. Recommendation was based upon Bushhog having similar-type work experience with the City and providing additional work experiences per the bid documents. The apparent-low bidder, TruGreen, did not provide similar-type work experience and were deemed non-responsive, per the bid documents.

City Council reviewed the DWM memo recommending award to Bushhog. At the May 24th Council Work Session, Council recommended that TruGreen submit additional references to

DWM and requested DWM to review the additional references and re-evaluate its recommendation of award.

On May 30, TruGreen LandCare provided the following references to DWM:

No.	Owner	Contact Name	Contact Phone	TruGreen's Stated Work
1	Marine Corp Base Quantico; Quantico, VA	Tim Dickerson	(703) 675-7532	Bush hogging, clearing, and easements, right-of-ways, and common area throughout Military Installation
2	Gwinnett County, GA; Transportation Department	Larry Garmon	(678) 639-8902	Annual mowing of over 250 miles of right-of-ways throughout Gwinnett County.
3	Fort Hood Army Base; Property Management Ft. Hood Family Housing	Marvin Williams – Director	(254) 291-7741	Mowing/Bush hogging of over 82,000,000 square feet of common areas, easements, and right-of-ways. Contract includes mowing lawns of soldiers when they are deployed.
4	Peachtree City, GA	Ken Williams – Contract Services Manager	(770) 631-2535	Mowing all city right-of-ways, and all other city entities.
5	Memphis Shelby County Airport	Roy Cotes and Damon Shields	(901) 922-8016	Bush hog/hand clearing Contract (25,000,000 sq ft)

On June 1, 2012, DWM staff began contacting the TruGreen references. In a to-date June 5, 2012 memo to the City Manager, DWM described limited success in contacting references due to unreturned phone calls and an invalid number provided. Only one discussion had been made with a TruGreen reference at that point (City of Peachtree City, GA).

The City Manager then requested that a senior-level staff member from DWM review TruGreen's new list of past work experiences and re-evaluate the award recommendation. Beginning June 8, 2012, DWM Utility Engineering Supervisor, Jerry F. Morrone, P.E., began contacting the additional work references provided by TruGreen, and was able to discuss recent past work with three (3) of five (5) TruGreen clients.

A phone log of recent contact is summarized in Attachment 1. Comments in the discussions are paraphrased unless indicated by "quotation marks", indicating verbatim comments.

Recommendation

From discussions with three (3) TruGreen references, TruGreen's work experience is not similar in size or scope to the work required in the SR-54 contract. Two (2) references mention that TruGreen did not perform *easement clearing* for them, while the third indicated TruGreen performed "less than 2 miles" of easement clearing, but expressed a "concern" for their ability to be able to complete 200 miles of easement clearing contract.

DWM recommends award to Bushhog America, Inc.

Attachment 1 – J. Morrone Phone Log Summary for TruGreen Reference Check

Date	Time	Contact Name/Info	Discussion/Comment
6/8/12	3:45	Ken Williams Contract Services Manager Peachtree City, GA 770-631-2535	Left message with receptionist re: needing confirmation of TruGreen's work with Peachtree City. Mr. Williams is out and will return on Tuesday, June 12. Mr. Williams is the only person that can provide comment on TruGreen's work.
6/8/12	3:50	Marvin Williams Ft Hood Army Base; Director Property Management Ft. Hood Family Housing (254) 291-7741	Left message asking for confirmation of TruGreen's work and if they performed easement clearing.
6/11/12	10:10	Tim Dickerson Marine Corp Base Quantico; Quantico, VA (703) 675-7532	Left message asking for confirmation of TruGreen's work and if they performed easement clearing.
6/11/12	10:15	Larry Garmon Gwinnett County, GA; Transportation Department 678) 639-8902	Left message asking for confirmation of TruGreen's work and if they performed easement clearing.
6/11/12	10:15	Marvin Williams Ft Hood Army Base; Director Property Management Ft. Hood Family Housing (254) 291-7741	Left message asking for confirmation of TruGreen's work and if they performed easement clearing.

Date	Time	Contact Name/Info	Discussion/Comment
6/11/12	10:20	Damon Shields Maintenance Control Coordinator Memphis Shelby County Airport (901) 922-8016	Left message asking for confirmation of TruGreen's work and if they performed easement clearing.
6/11/12	10:20	Gil Bobo Airfield Maintenance Memphis Shelby County Airport (901) 922-0120	Left message asking for confirmation of TruGreen's work and if they performed easement clearing.
6/11/12	1:35	Marvin Williams Ft Hood Army Base; Director Property Management Ft. Hood Family Housing (254) 291-7741	TruGreen has provided mowing and landscaping work for about 10 years. They have had "no issues" with TruGreen's quality. JM: "We have about 200 miles of easement clearing in this contract, many of it cross-county. Have they performed any easement clearing for you?" MW: On occasion, "they've done some; at most 2 miles". JM: "Would they be able to handle this contract?" MW: "200 miles concerns me a bit."
6/11/12	3:50	Larry Garmon Gwinnett County, GA; Transportation Department 678) 639-8902	Mr. Garmon left message returning my call. Says the best time to reach him is between 7:30 and 8:00 am and 3:30 to 4:00 pm.
6/11/12	3:55	Larry Garmon Gwinnett County, GA; Transportation Department 678) 639-8902	Left message with Mr. Garmon.

Date	Time	Contact Name/Info	Discussion/Comment
6/12/12	7:30	Larry Garmon Gwinnett County, GA; Transportation Department (678) 639-8902	TruGreen provided road R/W mowing and shoulder mowing. They have been doing this for 10 to 12 years. They have done a "real good job". JM: "We have about 200 miles of easement clearing in this contract, many of it cross-county. Have they performed any easement clearing for you?" LG: "No. It's mainly mowing."
6/12/12	7:45	Tim Dickerson Marine Corp Base Quantico; Quantico, VA (703) 675-7532	Left message asking for confirmation of TruGreen's work and if they performed easement clearing, and if so, how much.
6/12/12	8:10	Ken Williams Contract Services Manager Peachtree City, GA (770) 631-2535	TruGreen has performed landscaping, tree trimming, and street mowing for Peachtree City. They've "done well". This is their 2 nd renewal. JM: "We have about 200 miles of easement clearing in this contract, many of it cross-county. Have they performed any easement clearing for you?" KW: "They've never done easement clearing."