



Date: August 4, 2014

To: Thomas J. Bonfield, City Manager
Through: W. Bowman Ferguson, Deputy City Manager
From: Daniel M. Curia, Fire Chief
Subject: Durham Fire Department Self-Contained Breathing Apparatus Evaluation

Council Member Moffitt recently requested more information documenting the Durham Fire Department's (DFD) testing and evaluation process for self-contained breathing apparatus (SCBA). I will include a brief overview in this memo and attempt to highlight important parts of the internal DFD document.

The DFD engaged in a two month process to evaluate all SCBA that had been submitted for approval in the National Fire Protection Association (NFPA) standard 1981, 2013 edition, titled "Standard on Open-Circuit Self-Contained Breathing Apparatus for Fire and Emergency Services." Five manufacturers were contacted and subsequently submitted SCBA for DFD testing and review. During the testing process, the DFD reduced the group to two viable contenders; these were the MSA G1 SCBA and the Scott Safety X3 SCBA. Higher evaluation scores and uniformly positive verbal feedback from personnel were achieved by the Scott Safety X3 SCBA.

The internal DFD document detailing the evaluation results is submitted for your review. The 36 page document is assembled as follows:

Pages 1 and 2	General overview of the testing process
Pages 3 through 9	Manufacturer information and evaluator comments for the submitted SCBA
Page 9	Warranty information for submitted SCBA
Page 9	Conclusion and recommendation of product
Page 10	MSA G1 SCBA Positives/Negatives from DFD perspective
Pages 10 to 11	Scott Safety X3 SCBA Positives/Negatives from DFD perspective
Pages 12 to 16	Appendix 1 – SCBA Brochures Page 12 -- Avon SCBA brochure Page 13 – Interspiro SCBA brochure Page 14 – Drager SCBA brochure Page 15 – MSA SCBA brochure Page 16 – Scott Safety SCBA brochure
Pages 17 to 20	Appendix B – Internal memo detailing departmental SCBA Evaluation Program Guidance
Pages 21 and 22	Appendix C -- Copy of form letter sent to SCBA manufacturer representatives requesting SCBA for DFD evaluation
Page 23	Appendix D -- Copy of form letter sent to SCBA manufacturer representatives at the conclusion of the testing process

Page 24 to 31	Appendix E – Copy of internal SCBA scoring form utilized by DFD testing participants
Pages 32 to 34	Appendix F – Overview of the physical testing to which each SCBA was subjected
Pages 35 and 36	Internal memo detailing the results of the face to face focus group meetings held with personnel who tested the SCBA

Please let me know if you would like any further information concerning the evaluation of SCBA for potential purchase by the City of Durham or if you have any specific questions concerning the department's testing process.