



Date: September 21, 2015

To: Thomas J. Bonfield, City Manager

Through: Wanda S. Page, Deputy City Manager

From: Regina Youngblood, Director of Human Resources
DeShun Perry, Employee Relations Analyst

Subject: Unconscious Bias Training Recommendation

Executive Summary

This agenda item recommends a consultant to develop and deliver Unconscious Bias training to the City of Durham’s Water Management Department. This proposal is based on Human Resources recommendations from the Fall 2014 Water Management discipline analysis. In order to carry out the approved recommendation a services agreement must be approved by the City Council.

Recommendation

That the City Manager be authorized to execute a services agreement with JJA Consultants to deliver Unconscious Bias Training for the Water Management Department.

Background

The Human Resources Department reviewed all hires and promotions in Water Management that occurred between July 1, 2013 – November 1, 2014 and no irregularities were identified. Further, the department gathered data from 2011 to 2014 to perform a statistical analysis on discipline. The analysis concluded that there was no statistical evidence that discipline issued were out of proportion with the demographic makeup of the department’s primary work locations. However, Human Resources did find that when the supervisor and employee were of the same race the discipline issued was most likely to be a written reprimand and when the supervisor and employee were of a different race the discipline tended to be more severe. Also noted was the severity of disciplines issued to minority employees for similar infractions, which appeared to be harsher in some cases.

The Human Resources department provided four recommendations to the City Manager and those recommendations were to:

- conduct focus groups with Water Management staff,
- institute a technical review process of discipline that required a written reprimand or above,
- complete a monthly review of discipline data from the technical review;
- and retain a consultant to develop and deliver bias training to the Water Management department.

Issues and Analysis

On June 19, 2015, the City of Durham issued and advertised a Request for Qualifications (RFQ) for Unconscious Bias Training. Submissions were due by 5:00 pm on July 20, 2015. Only two qualified proposals were received, both from out-of-state vendors. In an effort to solicit additional responses and local submissions, the RFQ was reposted on August 3, 2015 with a submission deadline of August 12, 2015 by 5:00pm. Human Resources staff personally emailed Mable Rogers, Director of Membership Operations with the Greater Durham Chamber of Commerce to request her assistance in reaching local vendors. A copy of the RFQ was also sent to a local vendor who is known to provide similar services for response. Ultimately, a total of five qualified responses were received from out-of-state vendors.

As part of the evaluation selection process, an evaluation committee of three was created to review the proposals. Committee members represented the following areas: Human Resources, Audit Services and Water Management.

The evaluation criteria for all submitted proposals was scored in the following categories: experience, capacity, cost effectiveness , and vision. The committee invited the top four candidates to Durham for in person presentations.

Based on the evaluation scores and the in-person presentation, the evaluation committee selected JJA Consultants. The top two vendors' proposals and presentations were exceptional. However, the consensus of the group was to select JJA Consultants due to their experience working with other water management divisions on diversity and bias issues.

Alternatives

An alternative to contracting with JJA Consultants would be to have Human Resources staff develop and implement bias training. However, this alternative will require extensive research and staff resources that the department does have. Delay in delivering the recommended training will also delay the expected benefits associated with implementation.

Financial Impact

The total financial impact will be \$99,186.30. This total includes the costs associated with planning, reporting, instruction, consultant travel(air), hotel, training materials. The estimated cost includes a 10% first-time customer discount.

SDBE Summary

No SBDE goals were set. The Equal Opportunity/Equity Assurance Department reviewed the proposals submitted and determined that they are in compliance with the Ordinance to Promote Equal Business Opportunities in City Contracting.

Workforce statistics for JJA Consultants

Total Workforce- 34

Males- 14

Females- 20

Black Employees- 21 (62%)

White Employees- 13 (38%)

Attachments

Attachment 1 – Request for Qualifications (RFQ) that was posted on City of Durham Website