



**Date:** October 5, 2015

**To:** Thomas J. Bonfield, City Manager

**Through:** Wanda S. Page, Deputy City Manager

**From:** Regina Youngblood, Director of Human Resources  
DeShun Perry, Employee Relations Analyst

**Subject:** Approval of Consultant Contract for Unconscious Bias Training

### **Executive Summary**

On June 19, 2015, the City of Durham issued and advertised a Request for Qualifications (RFQ) for interested firms to assist the City with 1) developing unconscious bias training and/or intervention for the Water Management Department; 2) assessing, testing and identifying implicit biases; and 3) providing techniques that challenge implicit biases. Only two qualified proposals were received, both from out-of-state vendors. In an effort to solicit additional responses and local submissions, the RFQ was reposted on August 3, 2015 with a submission deadline of August 12, 2015 by 5:00pm. Human Resources, ultimately, received a total of five qualified responses from out-of-state vendors. JJA Consultants, Inc. was selected as the most desirable firm to award a contract for services.

### **Recommendation**

The Human Resources Department recommends that City Council approve JJA Consultants, Inc. from Fairfax, VA as the firm selected for consulting and technical assistance in developing unconscious bias training for the Water Management Department; and authorize the City Manager to execute a contract between the City of Durham and JJA Consultants, Inc. in the amount of \$99,187.00.

### **Background**

The Human Resources Department was asked to review all new hires and promotions that occurred within the Department of Water Management (DWM) between July 1, 2013 – November 1, 2014. Upon thorough analysis there were no irregularities identified. Further, the department gathered data from 2011 to 2014 to perform a statistical analysis on discipline. The analysis concluded that there was no statistical evidence that disciplinary actions issued were out of proportion with the demographic makeup of the department's primary work locations. Human Resources did find that when the supervisor and employee were of the same race the discipline issued was most likely to be a written reprimand. However, when the supervisor and employee were of a different race the discipline tended to be more severe. Findings demonstrated that the severity of discipline issued to minority

employees for similar infractions appeared to be harsher, in some cases, than actions taken against non-minority employees.

The Human Resources department provided four recommendations to the City Manager and those recommendations were to:

- conduct focus groups with DWM staff;
- institute a technical review process of discipline that required a written reprimand or above;
- complete a monthly review of discipline data from the technical review;
- and retain a consultant to develop and deliver bias training to the Water Management department.

Focus groups were conducted in February and April 2015 with DWM staff. Based on focus group feedback, many employees feel there is a racial and gender bias in Water Management in relation to discipline and hiring. The focus group feedback supports the recommendation for a bias training to address this perception. The technical review and monthly reporting on disciplinary actions was implemented in December 2014. This agenda item is to secure professional services to achieve the desired training.

### **Issues and Analysis**

On June 19, 2015, the City of Durham issued and advertised a Request for Qualifications (RFQ) for Unconscious Bias Training. Submissions were due by 5:00 pm on July 20, 2015. Only two qualified proposals were received, both from out-of-state vendors. In an effort to solicit additional responses and local submissions, the RFQ was reposted on August 3, 2015 with a submission deadline of August 12, 2015 by 5:00pm. Human Resources staff contacted the Greater Durham Chamber of Commerce, to request her assistance in reaching local vendors. A copy of the RFQ was also sent to a local vendor who is known to provide similar services for response. Human Resources received five (5) responses to the RFQ from the following firms:

<u>Firm</u>	<u>Location</u>
JJA Consultants, Inc.	Fairfax, VA
Infinity Consulting	Manassas, VA
Pope & Associates	Cincinnati, OH
ProbizAssoc	Canton, OH
Flentroy Morris Consultants	Washington, DC

As part of the evaluation selection process, a committee was created consisting of three individuals from throughout the organization. Committee members represented the following areas: Human Resources, Audit Services and Water Management.

The evaluation criteria for all submitted proposals was scored on a 100 point basis in the following categories: Experience (30), Capacity (30), Cost Effectiveness (10), and Project Vision (30). The committee invited the top four (4) candidates to Durham for in person presentations.

JJA has experience creating and delivering diversity and bias training for several federal and local government agencies such as: the Center for Disease Control, US Government Accountability Office, District of Columbia Water and Sewer and Miami-Dade County.

Based on the evaluation scores and the in-person presentation, JJA Consultants, Inc by consensus of the group, was selected for their experience working with other government agencies on diversity and bias issues; and is being recommended to the City Council for approval.

JJA Consultants will administer an implicit bias assessment to all Water Management employees in the first weeks of their engagement. In the four months following the assessment, JJA Consultants will design and deliver a customized training intervention to meet the organizations needs. The training will also be required for all Water Management employees. There will be separate sessions for management and non-management employees.

JJA Consultants is a full service consulting, training, facilitation and research firm offering comprehensive performance improvement services. With an average of 25+ years of experience in delivering best practice diversity consulting and training programs, experience in development and implementation of best-practice based tools and techniques that has assisted over 3,000+ public and private sector organizations achieve bottom-line results, the Evaluation Committee finds this firm to be most capable of delivering the beneficial outcomes for the Department of Water Management.

### **Alternatives**

An alternative to contracting with JJA Consultants would be to have Human Resources staff develop and implement bias training. However, this alternative will require extensive research and staff resources that the department does not have. Delay in delivering the recommended training will also delay the expected benefits associated with implementation.

### **Financial Impact**

The total financial impact will be \$99,187.00, which includes a 10% discount. The total includes the costs associated with planning, reporting, instruction, training materials, consultant travel (air) and lodging. Funds have been identified within the Water & Sewer Fund's operating (5100P100/728600) allocations to cover the cost of this contract agreement.

A breakdown of the project costs is provided in the following table:

<b>Task No.</b>	<b>Task Description</b>	<b>Subtotal</b>
<b>One</b>	<b>Requirements Definition, Project Planning, and Preparation</b>	<b>\$12,208.00</b>
	Assumption: Planning, Preparation and Attendance of 2 Hour Meeting on-site in Durham, NC; Project Workplan	
<b>Two</b>	<b>Assessment of Current Environment</b>	<b>\$15,621.00</b>
	Review of Data and Information Only as Provided by Client; Report of Results	
<b>Three</b>	<b>Customization of Intervention and Required Materials</b>	<b>\$24,708.00</b>
	Delivery of Curriculum and Materials for Intervention; Review of Draft and Delivery of Final	
<b>Four</b>	<b>Implementation of Pre-Work and 3.5-Hour the Intervention</b>	<b>\$39,125.00</b>
	Assumption: Pre-work by e-mail; On-site delivery of 10 - 3.5-hour sessions, two per day, with 25-30 participants each, completing delivery of the intervention to 250 employees in 5 days, over a period of not more than two weeks. It is assumed that the City of Durham will provide appropriate training facilities and equipment and will schedule and notify participants for training.	
<b>Five</b>	<b>Evaluation of Results and Reporting</b>	<b>\$13,745.00</b>
	Assumption: Delivery of each week of results within 5 days; 2 Training Delivery Reports and 1 Final Report with Overall Recommendations	
<b>Six</b>	<b>Optional Continued Support to Implement Next Steps</b>	<b>TBD</b>
	To be Determined based on Client Need	
	<b>Travel and ODCs</b>	<b>\$4,800.00</b>
	Assumption: Three trips to Durham, NC (One Trip in Task One for up to 3 Consultants, and 2 Trips in Task Four for Training Delivery for up to 2 Instructors per Trip)	
<b>Subtotal</b>		<b>\$110,207.00</b>
<i>10% Discount - First Time Customer</i>		<i>\$11,020.70</i>
<b>Discounted Cost to City of Durham</b>		<b>\$99,186.30</b>

### **SDBE Summary**

No SBDE goals were set. The Equal Opportunity/Equity Assurance Department reviewed the proposals submitted and determined that they are in compliance with the Ordinance to Promote Equal Business Opportunities in City Contracting.

Workforce statistics for JJA Consultants are as follows:

Total Workforce	34
Total Males	14
Total Females	20
Black Employees	21 (62%)
White Employees	13 (38%)