



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

DRAFT MINUTES

April 5, 2022, 9:00 a.m.
Virtual Meeting

I. Call to Order

Chair Bouchard called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

II. Roll Call

Members Present:

Matt Bouchard, Chair
Faye Calhoun
April Johnson
Laura Fieselman
Andrew Goolsby, Vice Chair
Katie Hamilton

Excused Members Absent:

Tad DeBerry

Staff Present:

Grace Smith, Planning Assistant Director
Karla Rosenberg, Senior Planner
Amanda Holmes, Clerk
Crista Cuccaro, City Attorney's Office
Chris Peterson, Technology Liaison

III. Adjustments to the Agenda – Vice Chair Goolsby noted that the address on the agenda was wrong. The agenda had one of the cases listed as 812 Lancaster Avenue when the address is actually 812 Lancaster Street.

Commissioner Fieselman noted that the agenda has one of the cases listed as 400 W Main Street while the staff report lists the address as 411 W Main Street. Karla Rosenberg noted that the correct address is 400 W Main Street.

Karla Rosenberg stated that she would like to add an update on the Historic Preservation Commission board positions as well as an update on 1106 Ninth Street to the agenda's new business.

Chair Bouchard noted that the new business on the agenda would be a) Minor COA report; B) excused/unexcused absences; C) excused and unexcused absences; D) update on 1106 Ninth Street.

IV. Approval of Summary Minutes for March 1, 2022.

MOTION: Approve the Minutes from March 1, 2022 (Fieselman, Goolsby 2nd).
ACTION: Motion carried, 5–0 (DeBerry was absent and Johnson was briefly absent)

V. Swearing-In of Witnesses

Chair Bouchard read the opening HPC statement and asked if there were any early dismissals required by Commission members or Commission members who might have a conflict of interest with the cases presented today. Vice Chair Goolsby stated that while he did not have a conflict of interest, he did want to be forthcoming and mention that he lives one block north away from one of the cases whose address will be presented: 812 Lancaster Street. He stated that he is outside of the requirement for recusing himself from voting. Chair Bouchard acknowledged the disclosure. Commissioner Fieselman stated that she would need to leave at 11:00 a.m. Commissioner Hamilton stated that she would need to leave at 11:45 a.m.

The Clerk to the Board administered the oath to all Citizens and staff who wished to speak at today's meeting.

VI. Certificates of Appropriateness

After the oath was given, Ms. Rosenberg asked that all staff reports and materials submitted at the meeting be made part of the permanent record with any additions, deletions, and/or corrections that may be necessary. All Commission members concurred.

Commissioner Johnson arrived to the meeting, so Clerk Holmes added her to the roll call to count her attendance.

a. Case COA2100109 – 400 West Main Street – New Construction

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Charles Nicholson and four others spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Charles Nicholson gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 400 West Main Street – New Construction.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of the application with the condition that the cornice line along the south elevation be brought around the outline of the hot tub.

MOTION: The Durham Historic Preservation Commission in the case COA2100109, 400 West Main Street – New Construction:

- The applicant is proposing the construction of a nearly 30-story tower (310 feet tall) on a vacant lot.
- The building will be constructed with stacked brick masonry, concrete, and glass at the lower levels and metal-framed glass walls and metal panels in upper levels.
- Seventeen street trees will be removed from the site and 23 new street trees will replace them.
- Seven large (25 to 27 feet wide by 56 feet 10 inches in height) polyvinyl-coated fabric mesh panels of 34% opacity will be placed along the west elevation of the parking garage if construction of Phase II on this parcel does not begin within six months of issuance of the temporary Certificate of Occupancy for phase one of the project.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the

Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA2100109, 400 West Main Street – SCOPE OF WORK, with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.
4. Approval is conditioned upon the approval of site plans currently under review (COA2100334 and D2100401).
5. The cornice line on the south elevation shall be continuous along the hot tub as shown in page 50 of the application materials.

(Hamilton, Fieselman 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 6–0 (DeBerry absent)

b. Case COA2200008 – 804 Shepherd Street – New Construction

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Sara Lachenman and one other spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Sara Lachenman gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 804 Shepherd Street – New Construction.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application with the condition of staff approval of a new elevation showing the two transom windows on the left side elevation to join with the window pair in the stairwell.

MOTION: The Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA2200008, 804 Shepherd Street – New Construction:

- The applicant is proposing a new two-story structure on a vacant lot.
- The structure will measure 31 feet in width at the street and 30 feet in height, set back 12 feet 7 inches from the street.
- A full front porch measuring six to ten feet in depth will span the street-facing elevation.
- The structure will be constructed with cementitious fiberboard siding (German profile); red bricks; fiberglass-clad wood windows (mostly two-over-two, double-hung); a solid wood front entry door with sidelights and transom; a fiberglass rear entry door; a wood porch railing; and architectural asphalt roof shingles.
- Lighting will consist of four black metal sconces (two flanking front door, one beside each rear and side entrance).
- A nine-foot wide ribbon concrete driveway will connect the street and a two-space parking pad (25 feet square) at the rear of the structure.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA2200008, 804 Shepherd Street – New Construction, with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.
4. The left side elevation windows at the stairs, the transom, and the double hungs will be paired in some configuration approved by staff and elevation will be provided to staff for approval.

(Goolsby, Hamilton 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 6–0 (DeBerry absent)

c. Case COA2200009 – 812 Lancaster Street – Modifications

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Chris McGhee and one other spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Chris McGhee gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 804 Shepherd Street – New Construction.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of the application with the condition of removing the removal of the lunette window from the scope of work.

MOTION: The Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA2200009, 812 Lancaster Street – Modifications:

- The applicant is proposing additions and modifications to a contributing structure.
- An existing rear dormer will be replaced with a larger rear dormer, and an existing rear addition will be replaced with a larger ground-level addition.
- Two front entry doors will consist of half-light over two-panel wood units; rear doors will consist of fiberglass fully glazed units.
- New windows will consist of triple-grid, simulated divided-light, three-over-one, wood units; nonoperable shutters will be removed from all street-facing windows.
- A screened porch with brick foundation, wood decking, and a wood lap wall section will attach to the rear of the home.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA2200009, 812 Lancaster Street – Modifications, with the following conditions:

1. The existing half circle lunette window at the front elevation of the structure shall remain and drawings shall be updated accordingly for staff approval;
2. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the commission at this commission hearing and attached to the COA;
3. The improvements may require additional approvals from other city or county departments or state or local agencies. The applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way, and for a compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

(Bouchard, Johnson 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 5–0 (DeBerry absent and Fieselman dismissed early)

VII. Old Business – None.

VIII. New Business

- a. 1106 Ninth Street: Due to significant termite damage found at the lower levels, the structure will need to be disassembled into pieces and reconstructed on-site (rather than moved whole)
- b. Vote to excuse Tad DeBerry’s absence (Bouchard, Goolsby 2nd)
Approved 5-0 (Fieselman dismissed early)
- c. There are three open positions for the Historic Preservation Committee, with two open positions with the county (general and attorney), and one position open with the city (Real Estate Developer).
- d. Amanda Holmes will provide a Minor COA report via e-mail by Thursday.

IX. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 11:29 a.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Amanda Holmes, Clerk
Historic Preservation Commission