



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

APPROVED MINUTES

June 6, 2023, 9:00 a.m.
Committee Room, 2nd Floor, City Hall
101 City Hall Plaza, Durham, NC

I. Call to Order

Chair Goolsby called the meeting to order at 9:01 a.m.

II. Roll Call

Members Present:

Andrew Goolsby, Chair
Alva Horton, Vice Chair
Matt Bouchard
Faye Calhoun
Rakeem Chambers
Deborah Greene
Michael Vampran
Kenneth Webb

Excused Members Absent:

April Johnson

Staff Present:

Scott Whiteman, Planning Manager
Karla Rosenberg, Senior Planner
Chezney UpChurch, Clerk
Aarin Miles, City Attorney's Office

III. Adjustments to the Agenda – Chair Goolsby removed item Historic Moments from Agenda.

IV. Approval of Summary Minutes

May 2, 2023

MOTION: Approve amended Minutes from May 2, 2023 (Bouchard/Greene 2nd).

ACTION: Motion carried, 8–0

V. Swearing-In of Witnesses

Chair Goolsby read the opening HPC statement and asked if there were any early dismissals required by Commission members or Commission members who might have a conflict of interest with the cases presented today. No conflicts of interest were noted, no members requested early dismissals.

The Clerk to the Board administered the oath to all Citizens and staff who wished to speak at today's meeting.

VI. Certificates of Appropriateness

After the oath was given, Chair Goolsby asked if any commission members needed to recuse themselves because of a conflict that would impact their ability to decide the case. No members requested a recusal. Karla Rosenberg introduced staff reports and materials, and submitted them

at the meeting to be made part of the permanent record with any additions, deletions, and or corrections that may be necessary.

a) COA2300013 – 1300 Broad St – New Construction *(continued from April meeting)*

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Jim Ashley and Steve Frasher spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Jim Ashley and Steve Frasher gave a brief overview of the proposed new construction at 1300 Broad St.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application.

MOTION: Commissioner Bouchard made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA2300013, 1300 Broad Street – New Construction:

- The applicant is proposing a new primary structure of 3.5 stories (2.5 of which face Broad Street) on a newly vacant lot.
- The structure will have a footprint of 1700 square feet and will be constructed with smooth cementitious fiberboard siding; cementitious fiberboard siding shingles; a brick pier foundation with wood lattice; aluminum-clad wood windows in a simulated divided-light, Prairie-style configuration; fully glazed fiberglass entry doors also in a simulated divided-light, Prairie-style configuration (two facing the street, two facing the side, one facing the rear), and architectural asphalt roofing shingles.
- Three HVAC units will be situated along the north side of the structure.
- An asphalt parking pad for six vehicles, with entry from the side street, will span the rear yard, with screening consisting of 13 Edward Goucher Abelias to the south and 10 wintergreen barberry to the north.
- An ADA-accessible concrete ramp, five feet in width, and faced with low brick retaining walls, will be located at the rear of the lot, along F street.
- Two black metal lanterns will be mounted to the wall, one between the two front entry doors and the other beside the rear entry door.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA2300013, 1300 Broad Street – New Construction, with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.
4. Approval of this COA is contingent upon approval of the associated site plan D2300033.

ACTION: Approved 8–0 (Bouchard, Webb 2nd)

b) COA2300021 – 807 Yancey Street – New Construction and Site Work

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Tom Hennessey and Jacob Linn spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Tom Hennessey and Jacob Linn gave a brief overview of the proposed New Construction and Site work at 807 Yancey St.

Break 10:31 AM – 10:41 AM

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of the application with 3.5-foot setback; however, with the full 6-foot setback requested by the applicant, staff does not recommend approval of the application.

MOTION: Commissioner Goolsby made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA2300021, 807 Yancey Street – New Construction and Site Work:

- The applicant is proposing a new primary structure on a vacant lot.
- The structure will be constructed with smooth, cementitious fiberboard lap siding, composite trim, pressure-treated wood columns faced with composite wrap, and architectural shingles.
- Windows will consist of clad wood units with simulated divided-light construction in a doublehung, two-over-one configuration.
- One new Shantung maple (*Acer truncatum*) will be planted in the street yard.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA2300021, 807 Yancey Street – New Construction and Site Work, with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

ACTION: Denied 0–8 (Goolsby, Bouchard 2nd)

Goolsby motioned to alter the agenda by moving COA2300031 – 801 Onslow St. and COA2300032 – 605 W. Main St. next on the agenda before COA2300022 and COA2300023.

ACTION: Passed 8–0 (Goolsby; Webb 2nd)

c) COA2300031 – 801 Onslow Street – New Construction of Accessory Structure & Site Work

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Mariel Beasley spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Mariel Beasley gave a brief overview of the proposed New Construction of Accessory Structure and Site work at 801 Onslow Street.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application.

MOTION: Commissioner Horton made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA2300031, 801 Onslow Street – New Construction of Accessory Structure and Site Work:

- The applicant is proposing a two-story accessory structure at the rear of a contributing primary structure.
- The new structure will measure 28 feet 4 inches to roof peak and will be constructed with a concrete slab foundation faced with red bricks; smooth, horizontal, cementitious fiberboard siding; fiberglass windows and doors in a two-over-two configuration; a long-panel beveled steel garage door; and architectural shingles.
- An elevated deck of pressure-treated lumber will run the length of the east elevation (facing the rear yard).
- A shed of no historical significance will be relocated within the rear yard.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA2300031, 801 Onslow Street – New Construction of Accessory Structure and Site Work, with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way;
3. Approval of this accessory structure does not constitute approval of its use as an accessory dwelling unit, which is subject to compliance with UDO Section 5.4.2.; and
4. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

ACTION: Approved 8–0 (Horton; Webb 2nd)

d) COA2300032 – 605 W. Main Street – Signs

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Kelli Otts spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Kelli Otts gave overview of updating signage at 605 W. Main Street.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application.

MOTION: Commissioner Bouchard made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that in the case COA2300032, 605 West Main Street – Signs:

- The applicant is proposing signage on a landmark property.
- One existing blade sign will be replaced, and three additional blade signs installed, each to separate buildings; these signs will measure 10 feet 8 inches in height and 2 feet 8 inches in width, projecting 3 feet from the building.
- A monument sign measuring 16 feet 6 inches in length, 1 foot in width, and 4 feet 6 inches in height will be installed in the front yard of one historic building.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA2300032, 605 West Main Street – Signs, with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.
4. New blade sign at site 38 shall be relocated to the Duke Street elevation at the corner of Duke and Morgan, and located within the brick infield at that corner.

ACTION: Approved 8–0 (Bouchard; Goolsby 2nd)

e) COA 2300022 – 805 Yancey Street – New Construction and Site Work

Staff Report: Scott Whiteman presented the case.

Speakers: Tom Hennessey and Jacob Linn spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Tom Hennessey and Jacob Linn requested to withdraw applications for both COA2300022 and COA2300023.

f) COA2300023 – 803 Yancey Street – New Construction and Site Work

Tom Hennessey and Jacob Linn requested to withdraw applications for both COA2300022 and COA2300023.

VII. Old Business

- a) Newsletter – Commissioner Bouchard no further updates on his end. Commissioner Vampran has updates on the layout: 8.5 in x 11 bifold portrait style, within the design are COA Fee updates, graphic map of Historic Landmark Districts and their respective locations and QR code to direct residents to Durham Historic Commission website. Photos are still needed for coversheet and pictures and text for the write up. Pictures dimensions should be 4 in x 4 in.

VIII. New Business

- a) Minor COA reports distributed to commissioners.

IX. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 11:47 a.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Chezney UpChurch, Clerk
Historic Preservation Commission